

**VIRGINIA BOARD OF DENTISTRY  
FORMAL HEARING MINUTES  
September 28, 2023**

**TIME AND PLACE:** The meeting of the Virginia Board of Dentistry was called to order at 9:02 a.m., on September 28, 2023, in Board Room 4 at the Perimeter Center, 9960 Mayland Drive, Suite 201, Henrico, Virginia, 23233.

**PRESIDING:** Nathaniel C. Bryant, D.D.S., President

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** William C. Bigelow, D.D.S.  
Sidra Butt, D. D.S.  
Sultan Chaudhry, D.D.S.  
Emelia H. McLennan, R.D.H.

**STAFF PRESENT:** Tonya Parris-Wilkins, D.D.S.  
Sarah Moore, Executive Assistant

**COUNSEL PRESENT:** James E. Rutkowski, Senior Assistant Attorney General

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Anne Joseph, Adjudication Consultant  
Michael Goodman, Esquire, Respondent's Council  
Nora T. Ciancio, Esquire, Respondent's Council

**ESTABLISHMENT OF A QUORUM:** With five Board members present, a panel was established.

**Carlos Privette  
Case No.:221532** Mr. Privette was present with legal counsel, Michael Goodman, Esquire, and Nora T. Ciancio, Esquire, in accordance with the Notice of the Board dated August 2, 2023.

Dr. Bryant swore in the witnesses.

Following Ms. Joseph's opening statement, Dr. Bryant admitted into evidence Commonwealth's Exhibits 1-3.

Testifying on behalf of the Commonwealth:

- Kimberly Hyler, DHP Senior Investigator

Following Mr. Goodman's opening statement, Dr. Bryant admitted into evidence Respondent's Exhibits A – I.

Testifying on behalf of the Mr. Privette:

- Dr. Tonya Ashe, D.D.S.

Dr. Privette testified on his own behalf.

Dr. Ashe testified via phone conference. Dr. Bryant swore in the witness.

Ms. Joseph and Mr. Goodman provided closing arguments.

**Closed Meeting:**

Dr. Chaudhry moved that the Board enter into a closed meeting pursuant to §2.1-311(A)(27) and Section 2.2-3712(F) of the Code of Virginia for the purpose of deliberation to reach a decision in the matter of Carlos Privette. Additionally, he moved that Board staff, Dr. Parris-Wilkins, and Ms. Moore and the Board Counsel, Mr. Rutkowski attend the closed meeting because their presence in the closed meeting was deemed necessary and would aid the Board in its deliberations. The motion was seconded and passed.

**Reconvene:**

Dr. Chaudhry moved to certify that the Board heard, discussed, or considered only public business matters lawfully exempted from open meeting requirements under the Virginia Freedom of Information Act and only such public business matters as were identified in the motion by which the closed meeting was convened. The motion was seconded and passed.


The Board reconvened in open session pursuant to §2.2-3712(D) of the code.

**Decision:**

Mr. Rutkowski read the Board's Decision that Mr. Carlos Privette's Case #221532 request for reinstatement of his dental license is denied. Dr. Dawson moved to accept the decision as presented by the Commonwealth and read by Mr. Rutkowski. Following a second, the motion passed unanimously.

**ADJURNMENT:**

The Board adjourned at 11:08 p.m.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Nathaniel C. Bryant, D.D.S., President

9 Dec 2023  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Jamie Sacksteder, Executive Director

12/11/23  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Date